August 8, 2019

**By Regular Mail and Email**

Robert M. Carlson, Esquire

President

American Bar Association  
321 North Clark Street  
Chicago, IL 60654

Email:  [*abapresident@americanbar.org*](mailto:abapresident@americanbar.org)*.*

[bcarlson@cpklawmt.com](mailto:bcarlson@cpklawmt.com?subject=)

RE: ABA Proposed Resolution 114

Dear President Carlson:

The undersigned members of the American Law Institute (ALI) have recently learned of proposed Resolution 114. We write both because the content of Resolution 114 is directly contrary to the position taken by ALI and because the “Report” submitted by the supporters of Resolution 114 inaccurately describes the actions and positions taken by ALI.

Resolution 114 seeks to adopt what is generally known as “affirmative consent” with respect to sexual behavior (the phrasing used in Resolution 114 is, “define consent in sexual assault cases as the assent…. expressed by words or action”). The “Report” makes clear that an “affirmative consent” standard is sought. The “Report” essentially has two components: 1) Claims about the position of ALI and 2) claims about “neurobiology.”  This letter primarily addresses the inaccurate information in the “Report” regarding ALI, but ends with a brief discussion of the asserted “neurobiology” since the same claims were made during the ALI discussions.

The “Report” correctly identifies Professor Stephen Schulhofer as the Reporter of the ALI Model Penal Code Sexual Assault and Related Offenses revision project.

When Professor Schulhofer began presenting drafts to the ALI Members Consultative Group and to the full ALI membership, the drafts contained commentary and “black letter” endorsing “affirmative consent.” The reaction to this approach was strongly negative as Professor Schulhofer confirmed in Tentative Draft No. 2 (April 2016):

“The treatment of consent and associated offenses in Preliminary Draft No. 5 provoked great controversy at the last Annual Meeting and at the 2015 October meetings of the Advisors/MCG and also the Council. Many argued that the proposed definition of consent adopted an ideal of “affirmative consent” at the expense of the largely tacit ways that people engage in sexual behavior in the real world. There was concern expressed that the definition covered behavior that was innocent, and that the criminal law should not dictate sexual mores in this evolving era.” (Tentative Draft No. 2 at *xv*)

At the ALI Annual Meeting in May 2016, a formal vote was taken. The “affirmative consent” approach was rejected and the following definition of consent was adopted as the Membership Approved definition of consent:

**SECTION 213.0. DEFINITIONS AND GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LIABILITY…**

**(6) *Definitions….***

**(d) “Consent”**

1. **“Consent” for purposes of Article 213 means a person’s willingness to engage in a specific act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact.**
2. **Consent may be express or it may be inferred from behavior—both action and inaction—in the context of all the circumstances.**
3. **Neither verbal nor physical resistance is required to establish that consent is lacking, but their absence may be considered, in the context of all the circumstances, in determining whether there was consent.**
4. **Notwithstanding subsection (6)(d)(ii) of this Section, consent is ineffective when given by a person incompetent to consent or under circumstances precluding the free exercise of consent, as provided in Sections 213.1, 213.2, 213.3, 213.4, 213.5, 213.7, 213.8 [*reserved*], and 213.9.**
5. **Consent may be revoked or withdrawn any time before or during the act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact. A clear verbal refusal—such as “No,” “Stop,” or “Don’t”—establishes the lack of consent or the revocation or withdrawal of previous consent. Lack of consent or revocation or withdrawal of consent may be overridden by subsequent consent given prior to the act of sexual penetration, oral sex, or sexual contact.**

For reasons that have not been explained to us, the ABA “Report” in support of Resolution 114 reveals no part of this history. Instead, the “Report” cites no ALI materials after 2014 and, as a result, is highly misleading.

This is very troubling. The ABA should not consider moving forward with an important matter where the “Report” purporting to justify the action is so obviously deficient. This is a matter of the essential integrity of the ABA. A vote based upon the current “Report” is not defensible because the “Report” absolutely excludes all relevant information about ALI’s actual position while repeatedly claiming support from ALI.

ALI has carefully considered exactly this issue and we have attached to this letter various ALI record documents memorializing the deficiencies with “affirmative consent” that led to its rejection by ALI. These attachments also address the “neurobiology” issue of “frozen fright.”  This also was rejected by ALI which explicitly adopted the position that, “Consent may be express or it may be inferred from behavior—both action and inaction—in the context of all the circumstances.”  Much more could be said about the deficiencies of the “Report” with respect to neurobiology, including the fact that the principal proponent of the “frozen fright” theory is Rebecca Campbell who is not a neurobiologist. *See, e.g.,* Emily Yoffe, The Bad Science Behind the Campus Response to Sexual Assault, The Atlantic, September 8, 2017  (“In her 2012 talk, Campbell acknowledged that she is not a neuroscientist, but rather is translating others’ work.”)  <https://www.theatlantic.com/education/archive/2017/09/the-bad-science-behind-campus-response-to-sexual-assault/539211/> The Yoffe article contains highly detailed examination and refutation of the “frozen fright” claims that must be examined and assessed by the ABA before permitting the “Report” to be a basis for ABA action.

In short, the “Report” is based on bad history and bad science. We respectfully submit that Resolution 114 is not appropriate for consideration by the ABA at this time. It should be withdrawn and, if its proponents desire further consideration, it merits a fair and balanced report that will allow informed consideration before any vote is taken.

Respectfully submitted,

**Frederic N. Smalkin**Chief U.S. District Judge, D.Md. (Ret.)  
Jurist-in-Residence  
 and Professor of Law  
University of Baltimore School of Law  
Baltimore, MD

**Kathryn M. Kase**

Law Office of Kathryn M. Kase

3720 Greenbriar

Houston TX

**Tyler Baker**ALI Life Member  
Carmel Valley, CA

**Thomas R. Newman**ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Edwin Williamson**

Sullivan & Cromwell LLP

Washington, DC

**Donna Elm**

Tampa, FL

**Jon M. Sands**Phoenix, AZ

**Hon. Evelyn Keyes**Justice, First Court of Appeals  
Houston, TX

**Stephen K. Huber**ALI Life Member  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Houston Law Center  
Houston, TX

**Daniel S. Kleinberger**Professor Emeritus, Mitchell Hamline  
School of Law  
Reporter, Uniform Law Conference  
Drafting Committee on the Uniform  
Limited Liability Company  
Protected Series Act  
St. Paul, MN

**Margaret Love**

Law Offices of Margaret Love

Washington, DC

**Victor Vilaplana**

Of Counsel

Foley and Lardner LLP

San Diego, CA

**Kate Stith**

ALI Life Member

Lafayette S. Foster Professor of Law

Yale Law School

New Haven, CT

**A.N. Field**  
New York, NY

**Herb Fenster**ALI Life Member  
Covington & Burling LLP  
Washington, DC

**Alfred W. Putnam**Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
Philadelphia, PA

**Michael P. Van Alstine**

Professor of Law, University of Maryland

Carey School of Law

Baltimore, MD

**Christopher Zampogna**Zampogna, PC  
Washington, DC

**John H. Cayce**Chief Justice, Texas Court of Appeals, Second District (Retired)  
Partner, Kelly Hart LLP  
Fort Worth, TX

**Steve Hut**  
Chevy Chase, MD

**William J. Leahy**Director, Office of Indigent Legal Services  
Albany, NY

**George Davidson**

New York, NY

**Charles Fried**  
Beneficial Professor of Law  
Harvard University Law School  
Cambridge, MA

**Ronald Henry**

Washington, DC

**Henry R. Lord**ALI Life Member  
Partner Emeritus  
DLA Piper LLP (U.S.)  
Baltimore, MD

**Robert A. Helman**

ALI Life Member

Partner and Former Chairman

Mayer Brown LLP

Chicago, IL

**Kenneth G. Dau-Schmidt**

Carr Professor of Law

Indiana University--Bloomington

Bloomington, IN

**Brian D. Shannon**Paul W. Horn Professor  
Texas Tech University School of Law  
Lubbock, TX

**Donna Elm**

Tampa, FL

**Kenneth C. Kettering**Short Hills, New Jersey

**Ralph Reisner**  
ALI Life Member  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Illinois College of Law  
Champagne, IL

**James B. Craven III**  
ALI Life Member  
Durham, NC

**Rob Goodin**  
ALI Life Member  
San Francisco, CA

**Marie T. Reilly**  
Professor of Law

Penn State University School of Law  
University Park, PA

**David Aronofsky**  
Retired General Counsel and Law Faculty Member  
University of Montana  
Austin, TX

**Arthur D. Hellman**  
ALI Life Member, Professor Emeritus  
University of Pittsburgh School of Law  
Pittsburgh, PA

**Anne Gardner**Justice, Second Court of Appeals  
Fort Worth, TX

**Bradley Y. Smith**

New York, NY

**Hon. Evelyn Keyes**Justice, First Court of Appeals  
Houston, TX

**John H. Cayce**Chief Justice, Texas Court of Appeals,

Second District (Retired)  
Partner, Kelly Hart LLP  
Fort Worth, TX

**Michael Greenberger**

ALI Life Member

Law School Professor

University of Maryland

Francis King Carey School of Law

Baltimore, MD

**John F. Olson**

Distinguished Visitor from Practice

Georgetown Law Center

Partner Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, LLP

Washington, DC

**Amon Burton**  
ALI Life Member  
Austin, TX

**Manning G. Warren**  
ALI Life Member  
H. Edward Harter Chair

of Commercial Law  
Brandeis School of Law  
University of Louisville  
Louisville, KY

**Thomas R. Newman**

ALI Life Member

New York, NY

**Ira Ellman**

Charles J. Merriam Distinguished

Professor of Law

Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law

Arizona State University

Tempe, AZ

**Stephen Lee Saltonstall**  
ALI Life Member  
Tucson, AZ

**Sheldon Raab**  
ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Nicholas L. Georgakopoulos**Harold R. Woodard Professor of Law  
Indiana University  
McKinney School of Law  
Indianapolis, IN

**Dianne Bennett**Retired, Managing Partner  
Hodgson Russ LLP  
Buffalo, NY

**Bill Brewbaker**  
Rose Professor of Law, University of Alabama Law School  
Tuscaloosa, AL

**Christie George**

James B. Duke Professor Emeritus of Law

Duke University School of Law

Durham, NC

**Noel Fidel**ALI Life Member  
Retired Judge  
Arizona Court of Appeals  
Law Office of Noel Fidel  
Phoenix, AZ

**George W. Liebmann**ALI Life Member  
Liebmann and Shively, P.A.  
Baltimore, MD

**G. Robert Blakey**

William J. & Dorothy

T. O'Neil Professor of Law Emeritus

Notre Dame Law School

Notre Dame, IN

**Robert Newman**ALI Life Member  
San Antonio, TX

**Dean A. Strang**StrangBradley, LLC  
Madison, WI

**Robert A. James.**Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman LLP  
San Francisco, CA

**David Shapiro**  
William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law Emeritus Harvard

University School of Law  
Cambridge, MA

**James Felman**Partner, Kynes,  
Markman, & Feldman  
Tampa, FL

**Catherine L. Carpenter**Vice Dean and The Hon. Arleigh M.

Woods and William T. Woods Professor

of Law Southwestern Law School  
Los Angeles, CA

**Michael G. Goldstein**ALI Life Member  
Newport Beach, CA

**Joan Wexler**  
ALI Life Member  
Dean and Professor of Law Emerita  
Brooklyn Law School  
Brooklyn, NY

**William Hodes**  
Professor Emeritus of Law  
Indiana University

Lady Lake, FL

Judge Benjamin Lerner

Philadelphia, PA

**Patrick Daugherty**Partner, Foley & Lardner LLP  
Chicago, IL

**Michael Zimmerman**  
ALI Life Member  
Partner  
Zimmerman Jones Booher  
Chief Justice, Utah Supreme Court (Ret.)  
Salt Lake City, UT

**Robert Cottrol**

Harold Paul Green Research Professor

of Law, The George Washington

University Law School

Washington, DC

**Theodore H. Frank**Washington, DC.

**Arthur T. Donato**

Law Offices of Arthur Thomas

Donato

Media, PA

**William Reynolds**

ALI Life Member

Jacob A. France Professor of Judicial

Process Emeritus University of

Maryland School of Law  
Baltimore, MD

**Laird Kirkpatrick**

ALI Life Member

Louis Harkey Mayo Research Professor of Law

The George Washington University

Law School

Washington, DC

**Ronald J. Allen**  
John Henry Wigmore Professor of Law  
Northwestern University  
Chicago, IL

**Ronald Henry**

Washington, DC

**Leonard P. Strickman**Professor, Founding Dean Emeritus  
Florida International   
University College of Law  
Miami, FL

**William Funk**

Lewis & Clark Distinguished Professor of Law

Lewis & Clark Law School

Portland, OR

**John L. Warden**  
ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Warren Belma**r

ALI Life Member

Washington, DC

**Ronald Rolfe**ALI Life Member  
New York, NY

**Thomas D. Waterman**Justice, Iowa Supreme Court  
Des Moines, IA

**Larry Catá Backer**W. Richard and Mary Eshelman Faculty Scholar  
 & Professor of Law  
Professor of International Affairs  
Pennsylvania State University  
University Park, PA

**Joseph Goldberg**ALI Life Member  
Albuquerque, NM

**Mary Massaron**Shareholder and Appellate Practice Group Leader  
Plunkett Cooney PC  
Bloomfield Hills, MI

**Robert W. Hillman**ALI Life Member  
Distinguished Professor of Law  
University of California-Davis  
Davis, CA

**Ellen S. Podgor**

Gary R. Trombley Family White-Collar

Crime Research Professor

Stetson University College of Law

Gulfport, FL

**William D. Dolan, III**

William D. Dolan, III, PC

Tysons Corner, VA

**Allen E. Shoenberger**  
Professor, Loyola Chicago School of Law  
Chicago, IL

**Christopher M. Newman**

Associate Professor of Law, Antonin Scalia Law School at

George Mason University

Arlington, VA

**John S. Beckerman**  
Morristown, NJ

**Peter J. Kalis**

Partner and Former Chairman and Global Managing Partner  
K&L Gates LLP  
Pittsburgh, PA

**Bridget M. McCormack**Justice, Michigan Supreme Court  
Lansing, MI

**Stephen Lee Saltonstall**  
ALI Life Member  
Tucson, AZ

**Arthur B. Spitzer**  
ALI Life Member  
Professor of Law and University Distinguished Professor  
Chicago-Kent College of Law  
Illinois Inst. of Technology  
Chicago, IL

**Adriane Dudley**Dudley Rich David LLP  
St. Thomas, VI

**Amon W. Burton**ALI Life Member  
Austin, TX

**Mark J. Loewenstein**

ALI Life Member

Monfort Professor of Commercial Law

University of Colorado

Boulder, CO

**Glenn Koppel**Professor of Law  
Western State College of Law  
Fullerton, CA

**Ira Robbins**

ALI Life Member

Barnard T. Welsh Scholar and Professor of Law

American University

Washington College of Law

Washington, DC

**Thomas C. Arthur**ALI Life Member, L.Q.C.   
Lamar Professor  
Emory University School of Law  
Atlanta, GA

President-Elect

Judy Perry Martinez

[judym@spsr-Law.com](mailto:judym@spsr-Law.com?subject=)

Chair, House of Delegates

William R. Bay

[wbay@thompsoncoburn.com](mailto:wbay@thompsoncoburn.com?subject=)

ABA Rules and Calendar Committee

[Rules@mail.americanbar.org](mailto:Rules@mail.americanbar.org)

Section of Civil Rights and Social Justice

Estelle H. Rogers

Forestville, CA

[1estellerogers@gmail.com](mailto:1estellerogers@gmail.com)

Mark I. Schickman

San Francisco, CA

[mis@freelandlaw.com](mailto:mis@freelandlaw.com)

Criminal Justice Section

Neal R. Sonnett

Miami, FL

[nrslaw@sonnett.com](mailto:nrslaw@sonnett.com)

Stephen A. Saltzburg

Washington, DC

[ssaltz@law.gwu.edu](mailto:ssaltz@law.gwu.edu?subject=)

Kevin Scruggs

[Kevin.Scruggs@AmericanBar.org](mailto:Kevin.Scruggs@AmericanBar.org)

Lucian Dervan

[Lucian.Dervan@Belmont.edu](mailto:Lucian.Dervan@Belmont.edu)

Section of Litigation

Dennis J. Drasco

Roseland, NJ

[ddrasco@lumlaw.com](mailto:ddrasco@lumlaw.com?subject=)

Judith A. Miller

Chevy Chase, MD

[judith.miller3@gmail.com](mailto:judith.miller3@gmail.com?subject=)

Don Bivens

Phoenix, AZ

[dbivens@swlaw.com](mailto:dbivens@swlaw.com?subject=)

Judicial Division

Richard N. Bien

Kansas City, MO

[rbien@lathropgage.com](mailto:rbien@lathropgage.com?subject=)

National Conference of

Federal Trial Judges

Elizabeth Snow Strong

Brooklyn, NY

[elizabeth\_stong@nyeb.uscourts.gov](mailto:elizabeth_stong@nyeb.uscourts.gov?subject=)

National Conference of State

Trial Judges

Christopher T. Whitten

Phoenix, AZ

[whittenc@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov](mailto:whittenc@superiorcourt.maricopa.gov?subject=)

Law Practice Division

Thomas C. Grella

Asheville, NC

[tgrella@mwblawyers.com](mailto:tgrella@mwblawyers.com?subject=)

Joan Rose Marie Bullock

San Diego, CA

[joan.bullock@tmslaw.tsu.edu](mailto:joan.bullock@tmslaw.tsu.edu?subject=)

Law Student Division

Ashley Baker

Stone Mountain, GA

[ashley\_baker@sulc.edu](mailto:ashley_baker@sulc.edu)

Erika Lessane

Chicago, IL

[Erikalessane2020@nlaw.northwestern.edu](mailto:Erikalessane2020@nlaw.northwestern.edu)

Solo, Small Firm and General Practice Division:

Stephen B. Rosales

Belmont, MA

[s.rosales@rosalesandrosales.com](mailto:s.rosales@rosalesandrosales.com?subject=)

James M. Durant III

Lemont, IL

[james.durant@science.doe.gov](mailto:james.durant@science.doe.gov?subject=)

Jennifer A. Rymell

Fort Worth, TX

[jarymell@msn.com](mailto:jarymell@msn.com?subject=)

Young Lawyers Division

Lacy L. Durham

Dallas, TX

[lacydurhamlaw@yahoo.com](mailto:lacydurhamlaw@yahoo.com?subject=)

Stefan Palys

Phoenix, AZ

[stefan.palys@stinson.com](mailto:stefan.palys@stinson.com?subject=)

Shenique A. Moss

Detroit, MI

[sheniquemoss@gmail.com](mailto:sheniquemoss@gmail.com?subject=)

Anna McMahon Romanskaya

San Diego, CA

[aromanskaya@starkllp.com](mailto:aromanskaya@starkllp.com?subject=)

Dana M. Hrelic

Hartford, CT

[dhrelic@hdblfirm.com](mailto:dhrelic@hdblfirm.com?subject=)

American Immigration Lawyers Association

Robert E. Juceam

New York, NY

[robert.juceam@friedfrank.com](mailto:robert.juceam@friedfrank.com?subject=)

Conference of Chief Justices

Gerald W. VandeWalle

Bismarck, ND

[gvandewalle@ndcourts.gov](mailto:gvandewalle@ndcourts.gov?subject=)

The Federal Bar Association

Ashley L. Belleau

New Orleans, LA

[abelleau@lawla.com](mailto:abelleau@lawla.com?subject=)

The Federal Circuit Bar Association

Kristin L. Yohannan

Washington, DC

[kristin.yohannan@gmail.com](mailto:kristin.yohannan@gmail.com?subject=)

Hispanic National Bar Association

Peter M. Reyes, Jr.,

Saint Paul, MN

[peter.reyes@courts.state.mn.us](mailto:peter.reyes@courts.state.mn.us?subject=)

National Asian Pacific American

Bar Association

Wendy C. Shiba

Altadena, CA

[wendy.shiba@me.com](mailto:wendy.shiba@me.com?subject=)

National Association of Attorneys General

Ellen F. Rosenblum,

Salem, OR

[ellen.f.rosenblum@doj.state.or.us](mailto:ellen.f.rosenblum@doj.state.or.us?subject=)

National Association of Women Judges

Toni E. Clarke

Upper Marlboro, MD

[tclarke.ncstj@comcast.net](mailto:tclarke.ncstj@comcast.net?subject=)

National Bar Association

Eileen M. Letts

Chicago, IL

[eletts@zuberlaw.com](mailto:eletts@zuberlaw.com?subject=)

National Conference of Commissioners

on Uniform State Laws:

Anita Ramasastry

Seattle, WA

[arama@u.washington.edu](mailto:arama@u.washington.edu?subject=)

National Conference of Women’s

Bar Associations:

Marjorie A. O’Connell,

Washington, DC

[maoc@oconnell-associates.com](mailto:maoc@oconnell-associates.com?subject=)

National District Attorneys Association

Mathias Henry Heck, Jr.

Dayton, OH

[heckm@mcohio.org](mailto:heckm@mcohio.org?subject=)

National Legal Aid and Defender Association

Jo-Ann Wallace

Washington, DC

[j.wallace@nlada.org](mailto:j.wallace@nlada.org)

National Native American Bar Association

Gerald Brian Gardner

West Hollywood, CA

[jerry@tlpi.org](mailto:jerry@tlpi.org?subject=)